|  |
| --- |
| **FPP Review comments on the draft monitoring framework for the post-2020 global biodiversity framework** |
| *Contact information* |
| **Surname:** | Carino |
| **Given Name:** | Jocelyn |
| **Government** (if applicable)**:**  |  |
| **Organization:** | Forest Peoples Programme |
| **Address:**  | 1c Fosseway Business Centre, Stratford Road |
| **City:** | Moreton-in-Marsh |
| **Country:** | United Kingdom |
| E-mail: | joji@forestpeoples.org |
|  |  | ***Comments*** |
| **Table** | **Page** | **Column letter** | **Row number** | **Comment** |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | **General comments to Table 1 (Goals) and Table 2 (Targets).** The comments provided here are informed by the key findings of LBO-2 which compiled and analysed 60 case studies authored by IPLCs regarding progress in the implementation of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity (2011-2020) and the 20 Aichi Biodiversity Targets. **Conceptual issue - The close inter-linkages between biological and cultural diversity (nature and culture).** These documents separate biological diversity from cultural diversity, reinforcing a nature-human dichotomy which does not accord with the reality of integrated social ecological systems as understood today. This fundamental problem has characterised previous biodiversity strategies, including the current 2011-2020 Strategic Plan. Continued treatment of ecosystems, species and genes as discrete components separate from the social, political, economic and cultural systems in which they are embedded (“biodiversity in a bubble”) cannot lead to transformative change towards humans “living in harmony with nature”. The roadmap itself separates humans from nature, rather than understanding, interrogating and addressing this broken relationship. Comments relevant to Table 1 (Goals) and Table 2 (Targets): * Equitable environmental governance is central to the success of the post2020 GBF. Unequal governance arrangements which exclude indigenous peoples and local communities in decision-making are driving loss of biological and cultural diversity. Addressing this problem across the entire architecture of post2020 global biodiversity strategy – its goals, target and indicators - is required to lead to transformational change. Therefore, recognising the contributions of IPLCs, women and youth through secure land tenure and customary rights over resources are essential components in Goals A, B and C, as well as a distinct Target 20 to address the problem of unequal and unfulfilled outcomes. Failure to do so will repeat the failures of the 2011-2020 Strategy, including where T18 was not mainstreamed and has not been met. Formulations which may be discriminatory towards IPLCs need to be evaluated and avoided – e.g. Target 4 may be punitive, and Target 8 and 9 make invisible the contributions of IPLCs.
* Ecosystem-based approaches require subsidiarity of decision-making at the lowest appropriate level. The focus on monitoring global goals and targets is not consistent with the ecosystem-based approach. Successful implementation requires monitoring at the appropriate scale of landscapes ecosystem or landscapes and the corresponding outcomes for IPLCs.
* Community-based monitoring and information systems (CBMIS) are essential complementary tools to global and national monitoring and reporting on all the Goals and Targets. Very few indicators relate to the roles, rights and contributions of IPLCs, and to the interlinkages between biological and cultural diversity. The current suite of indicators is incomplete and would generally require data disaggregation to monitor outcomes for IPLCs, women and youth.
 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | General comments to Table 1 (Goals) * Sharp distinctions are drawn between conservation and sustainable use (Goals A and B) which do not capture the realities of territories of IPLCs which combine customary conservation and sustainable use.
* Nature’s contributions to people need to be complemented by peoples’ contributions to nature (Goal B but also in Goal A) because good biodiversity outcomes arise from close relational values between humans and nature, not only from intrinsic or instrumental values.
* Means of Implementation (Goal D) need to be embedded in the substantive goals and targets. This problem was addressed in the SDGs by incorporating sub-targets pertaining to MOI within the targets themselves. The same can be done in the post2020 GBF by including MOI components under the different goals and targets.
 |
| 1 | 1-4 | A-B |  | **General comments on Goal A:** 1. Securing IPLCs’ land tenure is very relevant to this goal but not included here yet.
2. Concerning the term ‘natural’ in A1: what is considered natural in most cases in reality are IPLC lands with low human impacts.[[1]](#footnote-2)
 |
| 1 | 2 | B | After row 14, in relation to A1. | **Propose to add:** Trends in extent and quality of seemingly “natural” critical ecosystems with low-human impact, including IPLC territories, lands and waters as a distinct land use category. |
| 1 | 2 | A | To go after row 14  | **Propose to add A1. bis**: Increased extent and security of customary land tenure of IPLCs |
| 1 | 2 | C | After row 14, in relation to the proposed A1bis | **Propose to add:** * SDG indicator 1.4.2 land tenure: Proportion of total adult population with secure tenure rights to land, (a) with legally recognized documentation, and (b) who perceive their rights to land as secure, by sex and type of tenure
* CBD indicator: Trends in land-use change and land tenure in the traditional territories of IPLCs (COP decision X.43)
 |
| 1 | 2-3 | A | After row 28 | **Propose to add A2. bis**: Integrity and intactness of IPLC territories, lands, waters and resources |
| 1 | 2-3 | B | After row 28, in relation to proposed A2 bis | **Propose to add:** Trends on integrity and intactness of IPLCs’ territories, lands, waters and resources (terrestrial, freshwater and marine ecosystems) |
| 1 | 3  | B | After row29-33 | **Propose to add** (in relation to A3 and A4): Trends in conservation status of culturally significant species for IPLCs |
| 1 | 3 | C | After row 29-33 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal in B here above): * Overlap living planet index and languages diversity map
* Indigenous Red list, e.g. from Guatemala as a form of data disaggregation
 |
| 1 | 4 | B | After 41 | **Propose to add** (in relation to A5): Trends in community-based maintenance, recovery and restoration of genetic diversity of wild and domesticated plants and animals, e.g. from Community Registers |
| 1 | 4 | C | After 41 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal in B here above): Number of community-based initiatives for the maintenance, recovery and restoration of genetic diversity of wild and domesticated plants and animals |
| 1 | 5 | A | After 50 | **Propose to add A6. bis**: Legal recognition of IPLCs’ customary lands, territories and resources |
| 1 | 5 | B | After 50 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal A6.bis)**:** Trends in legal recognition of IPLCs’ customary lands, territories and resources |
| 1 | 5 | C | After 50 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal A6.bis)**:** * Coverage of IPLC lands, territories and waters secured, through various mechanisms and tenures
* Trends in security of customary land tenure of IPLCs overlapping KBAs, overlapping PAs,
 |
| 1 | 5  |  |  | **General comment on Goal B:** This goal addresses nature’s contributions to people but does not recognise people’s contributions to nature, e.g. through customary sustainable use (LBO one source of IPLCs’ contributions) |
| 1 | 5 | C | 56 | Need more than this indicator on certified forest to address Trends in regulation of climate.**Propose to add:**Trends in the application of social and environmental safeguards under the UNFCCC (TK etc), Trends in REDD+ (see CIFOR publication) |
| 1 | 5-6  | A | After 63 | **Propose to add B1.bis**: Recognition of IPLCs’ contributions to enhancing nature’s regulating functions and wellbeing of IPLCs, e.g. watershed management  |
| 1 | 5-6 | B | After 63 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal B1.bis)**:** Trends in government recognition of customary sustainable use practices of IPLCs (e.g. through special cultural zones, ancestral domains, IPAs, indigenous reserves and other means) |
| 1 | 6 | B | After 63 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal B1.bis)**:**Trends in the number of IPLC initiatives and collective actions that contribute to nature’s functions (pollination, climate etc). LBO Online can be a repository of these case studies. |
| 1 | 6 | C | After 63 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal B1.bis)**:**Number of IPLC initiatives and collective actions that contribute to nature’s functions (pollination, climate etc). LBO Online can be a repository of these case studies. |
| 1 | 6 |  |  | **General comment on Goal C:** It needs to expand benefit-sharing from use of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge to use of biological resources and to include broader other forms of benefit-sharing linked to conservation and sustainable use |
| 1 | 6 | A | 72 | C1. **Propose to add** ‘biological and’ before ‘genetic’ and add ‘and associated traditional knowledge at the end of the sentence, so it would read: Access to biological and genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge  |
| 1 | 6 | B | After 73 | **Propose to add**: Trends in access to biological resources and associated TK |
| 1 | 6 | B | After 73 | **Propose to add:** Trends in access to traditional knowledge associated with genetic resources |
| 1 | 6 | B | After 73 | **Propose to add:**Trends in National policies, laws, programmes and projects supporting access and benefit-sharing provisions with IPLCs |
| 1 | 6 | C | After 73 | **Propose to add:**New indicators related to trends in access to biological resources and associated traditional knowledge, e.g.: * Number of national policies, laws

Number of contractual agreements with IPLCs for use of TK associated with genetic resource:* Number of bio-trade contracts made with IPLCs
* Numbers of PES agreements with IPLCs
 |
| 1 | 6-7 |  |  | **General comment on Goal D:**While equitable participation is included in Table 2, it is totally absent here. It should be added here in table 1, in line with the proposed Target 20 (at page 39-40 of this document).  |
| 1 | 7 | B | After 80 | **Propose to add** (in relation to D1): Trends in recognition of monetary and non-monetary contributions arising from collective actions of IPLCs |
| 1 | 7 | C | After 80 | **Propose to add** (in relation to D1): Data disaggregation of all financial contributions for biodiversity to count direct support for IPLCs. |
| 1 | 7 | A | After 80 | **Propose to add D1.bis**:Robust mechanisms for equitable decision-making |
| 1 | 7 | B | After 80 | **Propose to add** (in relation to D1.bis):Elements related to equitable participation:* Trends in participation of IPLCs
* Trends in recognition of rights of IPLCs
* Trends in participation of Women

 and girls* Trends in participation of youth
 |
| 1 | 6 | C |  | Develop indicators related to participation and rights through appropriate process (see for examples United Nations Decade on Family Farming)[[2]](#footnote-3) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | General comments to Table 2 (Targets) The placement of IPLCs, women, and youth participation and rights to resources, solely in a separate, stand-alone and final target, rather than being addressed in all relevant Goals and Targets reinforces the division between nature and culture, rather than close relational values between IPLCs, conservation, sustainable use and benefit-sharing. CBD articles 8(j) and 10(c) embed traditional knowledge and customary sustainable use as integral components of  *In-situ Conservation* and *Sustainable Use,* and this approach should be reflected in the relevant targets of the post2020 GBF. While recognition of the rights of IPLCs as a *means of implementation* is welcome, these rights are also substantively linked to Goal A, B and C, and Targets 1-19. Suggestions towards this end have been provided. * The proposed indicators under Target 20 (land use change, land tenure and traditional occupations) which have been adopted through COP decisions, are wrongly placed in the framework, because these are necessary components in Goals A, B and C and associated Targets. Appropriate indicators for the recognition of rights, and for participation, need to replace them in Target 20, and these should be moved into relevant other Targets.
 |
| 2 | 10 (T1) | A | After 34 | **Propose to add component T1.5 bis**Full legal recognition of IPLC lands/territories as a distinct land category contributing to conservation, sustainable use and restoration outcomes  |
| 2 | 10 | B | After 34 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal T1.5 bis)Community based monitoring and information systems (CBMIS), e.g. community mapping |
| 2 | 10 | C | After 34 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal T1.5 bis)* SDG indicator 1.4.2 land tenure: Proportion of total adult population with secure tenure rights to land, (a) with legally recognized documentation, and (b) who perceive their rights to land as secure, by sex and type of tenure
* CBD indicator: Trends in land-use change and land tenure in the traditional territories of IPLCs (COP decision X.43)
 |
| 2 | 10 | C | After 34 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal T1.5 bis)* Trends in low-impact ecosystems under customary tenure
* Trends in forest and agricultural land under customary tenure
 |
| 2 | 12 (T2) | A | 35-52 | **General comment Propose to add** In relation to the IPLC land classification as a distinct category in Target 1, data disaggregation (overlap IPLC lands with PAs, OECMs, joint management, etc) would need to be added in T2. |
| 2 | 11-12 | B | In 46-48 or after 48 | **Propose to add** Indicators on equitable governance with relevant indicators (building on work by IIED) as part of the indicators process between COP 15 and COP 16 |
| 2 | 12 (T3) | A | After 55 | **Propose to add**T3.3: Active management by IPLCs of flora, fauna and wild species in their lands and territories  |
| 2 | 12 | B | After 55 | **Propose to add** Trends in monitoring, conservation and restoration of species in IPLC territories  |
| 2 | 12 | C | After 55 | **Propose to add**Community based information monitoring systems; potential use of Indigenous Navigator data sets.  |
| 2 | 13 (T4) | A | 56-60 | **Propose to add** Component T4.1 should add the wording ‘… taking into account and respecting customary sustainable use of IPLCs’ at the end of the sentence. And include relevant indicator in column C. Note: illegality is problematic for IPLCs where customary sustainable use (CSU) patterns have been rendered illegal by national regulations or laws (rotational farming, e.g.). Further ‘legal’ is prioritised here over ‘sustainable’ where the primary concern of the CBD is towards sustainable use. This target must be compliant with the rights of indigenous peoples. |
| 2 | 13 | B | After 60 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal on T4.1 above)Trends in the recognition and respect of customary sustainable use requirements and practices in relation to harvest of wild fauna and flora  |
| 2 | 13 | A | 61-63 | **Propose to add** Component T4.2 should add the wording ‘… taking into account and respecting customary sustainable use of IPLCs’ at the end of the sentence. And include relevant indicator in column C.  |
| 2 | 13 | B | After 63 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal on T4.2 above)Trends in the recognition and respect of customary sustainable use requirements and practices in relation to trade of wild fauna and flora |
| 2 | 13-14 | A | 64-66 | **Propose to add** Component T4.3 should add the wording ‘… taking into account and respecting customary sustainable use of IPLCs’ at the end of the sentence. And include relevant indicator in column C.  |
| 2 | 14 | B | After 66 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposal on T4.3 above)Trends in the recognition and respect of customary sustainable use requirements and practices in relation to active management and sustainable use of wild fauna and flora |
| 2 | 14 (T5) | A | 67 | **Propose to add** (in all components) “in priority sites or territories under the jurisdiction of IPLCs”Note: Given the role and contributions of IPLCs in detection, control and management of AIS |
| 2 | 14-15 | B | 67-76 | **Propose to add toT5.1 -T5.3 monitoring elements**“by IPLCs” |
| 2 | 15 | B | 77 | **Propose to add in T5.4**“on IPLCs” |
| 2 | 15 | A | 78-80 | **Propose to add to T5.5 components**and territories under the jurisdiction of IPLCs |
| 2 | 14-15 | C | 67-80 | **Propose that all indicators be disaggregated to include data on IPLCs contributions to detection, control, management and eradication of AIS** |
| 2 | 17 (T7) | A | 101 | **Propose to add**In T7.2, and ‘and IPLCs’ after ‘biodiversity’ so that it would read: Minimised negative impacts on biodiversity and IPLCs from any mitigation, adaptation and disaster risk reduction measures  |
|  |  | B | After 102 | Include monitoring element about avoiding or minimizing impacts on IPLCs (e.g. UNFCCC MRV system) |
|  |  | C | After 102 | Include indicators about avoiding or minimizing impacts on IPLCs (e.g. from UNFCCC MRV system) |
| 2 | 20 (T8) | A | After 116 | **Propose to add:** **T8.2 bis: Customary sustainable use of wild species of fauna and flora**Note: The target focuses on benefits for the most vulnerable people, and nutritional, livelihood and other benefits from the active management of wild species. This is very close to customary sustainable use. |
| 2 | 20 | B | After 116 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposed T8.2 bis):* Trends in securing land and resources of IPLCs (Note: operationalization of T20 in relation to rights to resources)
* Trends in practice of active management of wild species, including through customary sustainable use as captured by CBMIS**,** e.g. Trends in the practice of traditional occupations
 |
| 2 | 20 | C | After 116 | **Propose to add**Indicator on IPLCs’ food security, nutrition and livelihoods IPLCs’ seed banks in situ (and deposited in ex situ collections e.g. IP potatoes at Svalbard)Note: If certification schemes are the main indicators, there is a mismatch between what the goal says and what is being measured. The current focus is still on industry and large-scale users, and not sufficiently on IPLCs. |
| 2 | 21 (T9) | A | After 126 | **Propose to add:** T9.3 bis: Customary sustainable use of agriculture, aquaculture and forests  |
| 2 | 20 | B | After 126 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposed T9.3 bis):Trends in recognition of customary sustainable use in agriculture, aquaculture and forests |
| 2 | 20 | C | After 126 | **Propose to add** (in relation to proposed T9.3 bis):* SDG indicator 1.4.2 land tenure: Proportion of total adult population with secure tenure rights to land, (a) with legally recognized documentation, and (b) who perceive their rights to land as secure, by sex and type of tenure
* CBD indicator: Trends in land-use change and land tenure in the traditional territories of IPLCs (COP decision X.43)
* Trends in the practice of traditional occupations (COP decision X.43)
* Trends in the practice and legal recognition of traditional agriculture
 |
| 2 | 20 | C | 118-119 | SDG indicators 2.3, 2.4 and 2.5 are highly relevant for customary sustainable use and data generated for relevant indicators under this target need to be disaggregated for IPLCs and monitored through CBMIS.2.3 By 2030, double the agricultural productivity and incomes of small-scale food producers, in particular women, indigenous peoples, family farmers, pastoralists and fishers, including through secure and equal access to land, other productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services, markets and opportunities for value addition and non-farm employment 2.3.1 Volume of production per labour unit by classes of farming/pastoral/forestry enterprise size 2.3.2 Average income of small-scale food producers, by sex and indigenous status 2.4 By 2030, ensure sustainable food production systems and implement resilient agricultural practices that increase productivity and production, that help maintain ecosystems, that strengthen capacity for adaptation to climate change, extreme weather, drought, flooding and other disasters and that progressively improve land and soil quality 2.4.1 Proportion of agricultural area under productive and sustainable agriculture 2.5 By 2020, maintain the genetic diversity of seeds, cultivated plants and farmed and domesticated animals and their related wild species, including through soundly managed and diversified seed and plant banks at the national, regional and international levels, and promote access to and fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge, as internationally agreed 2.5.1 Number of plant and animal genetic resources for food and agriculture secured in either medium or long-term conservation facilities 2.5.2 Proportion of local breeds classified as being at risk, not-at-risk or at unknown level of risk of extinction  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 21 (T10) |  |  | General comment on T10:Nature based solutions are not self-executing, and need relevant knowledge to be applied, e.g. culture-based and human rights approach alongside it. Target 10 components should include IPLC elements, here below is an example about water  |
| 2 | 21 | B | After row 131 | **Propose to add (in T10.3):**Trends in inclusion of IPLCs in water regulation and management, where waters are under the jurisdiction of IPLCs(Note: supports operationalisation of Target 20) |
| 2 | 22 (T11) | A | 134 | **Propose to add in T11.2:** including for IPLCs, arising from customary sustainable use, so it would read:Contributions of biodiversity to health and well-being, including for IPLCs arising from customary sustainable use |
| 2 | 22 | B and C | 134 -139 | Monitoring elements and Indicators to be disaggregated for IPLCs and women |
| 2 | 22 (T12) |  |  | General comment on Target 12: For IPLCs to share more broadly in benefit-sharing, this needs to be expanded to include benefits arising from use of genetic resources, as well as biological resources.  |
| 2 | 22 | A | 72 | C1. **Propose to add** ‘biological and’ before ‘genetic’ and add ‘and associated traditional knowledge at the end of the sentence, so it would read: Access to biological and genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge  |
| 2 | 22 | B |  | **Propose to add**: Trends in access to biological resources and associated TK |
| 1 | 6 | B |  | **Propose to add:** Trends in access to traditional knowledge associated with genetic resources |
| 1 | 6 | B |  | **Propose to add:**Trends in National policies, laws, programmes and projects supporting access and benefit-sharing provisions with IPLCs |
| 1 | 6 | C |  | **Propose to add:**New indicators related to trends in access to biological resources and associated traditional knowledge: * Number of national policies, laws and administrative measures with provisions supporting access and benefit-sharing arrangements with IPLCs
* Number of countries respecting and recognising community protocols
* Number of contractual agreements with IPLCs for use of TK associated with genetic resource:
* Number of ethical biotrade contracts made with IPLCs
* Numbers of Payment for Environmental Services (PES) agreements with IPLCs
 |
| 2 | 25-26 (T13) | A | 152-156 | **Propose to add**Propose to change from ‘biodiversity’ to ‘biological and cultural diversity’ in T13.1 |
| 2 | 25-26 | B | 152-156 | **Propose to add**Propose to change ‘Biodiversity..’ to ‘Biological and cultural diversity…’ throughout all monitoring elements related to T13.1  |
| 2 | 25-26 | C | 154-156 | **Proposed to add:** Number of countries which have incorporated cultural values into development processes, poverty reduction strategies and sectoral plans |
| 2 | 27 | A | 159-161 | **Propose to add**Propose to change from ‘biodiversity’ to ‘biological and cultural diversity’ in T13.3 |
|  | 27 | B | 159-161 | **Propose to add**Propose to change ‘Biodiversity..’ to ‘Biological and cultural diversity…’ throughout all monitoring elements related to T13.3 |
| 2 | 27 | C | 159-161 | **Proposed to add:**Number of countries which incorporate cultural values in policies and regulations, including in strategic environmental assessments and environmental impact assessments. |
| 2 | 27- 30(T14) |  |  | **General comments:** In relation to supply chains, human rights due diligence by corporation at all stages of their supply chains and need to be taken into account. Initiatives such as the High Conservation Value Resource Network and the High Carbon Stock Approach need to be incorporated. [[3]](#footnote-4) |
| 2 | 31 (T15) | C | 190-192 | Note: CBMIS can count IPLC plans complementing government plans on Target 15 (data disaggregation) |
| 2  | 32 (T16) | C | 201-2014 | **Propose to add** indicators under 16.1, 16.2, 16.3 and 16.4 Percentage of Parties to the Cartagena Protocol implementing the relevant provisions of the Protocol in regard to IPLCs. (data disaggregation) |
| 2 | 33-34 (T17) | A | After 210 | **Propose to add 17.3**Increase in positive incentives directed at local level initiatives, including promoting IPLC contributions, to conservation and sustainable use |
|  |  | B | After 210 | T17.3 Trends in development of locally focused positive incentives for local actions on biodiversity |
| 2 | 34-36 (T18) | C | 211-225 | **Propose to add**: Data disaggregation of all financial contributions for biodiversity to count direct support for IPLCs. |
| 2 | 36  | A | After 225 | **Propose to add** T18.5 bis:* Increase recognition of monetary and non-monetary contributions arising from collective actions of IPLCs,
* Increase in direct funding and support for capacity building and technology transfer for IPLCs
 |
| 2 | 36 | B | After 225 | **Propose to add** (in relation to T18.5 bis): * Trends in recognition of monetary and non-monetary contributions arising from collective actions of IPLCs
* Trends in direct funding for IPLCs
* Trends in capacity building with IPLCs
* Trends in technology transfer with IPLCs
 |
| 2 | 37T19) | A | After 231 | **Propose to add T19.1 bis:**Availability of reliable and up-to-date biodiversity-related indigenous and local knowledge[[4]](#footnote-5) |
| 2 | 37 | B | After 231 | **Propose to add (in relation to T19.1 bis):**Trends in availability of biodiversity-related indigenous and local knowledge |
| 2 | 37 | C | After 231 | **Note**: Indicators would need to be developed in relation to T19.1 bis through appropriate technical process between COP15 and COP16 |
| 2 | 37 | A, B | 232-233 | **Propose to add**In T19.2, Change from ‘biodiversity’ to ‘biological and cultural diversity’ |
| 2 | 37-38 | A, B | 234-235 | **Propose to add**In T19.3, Change from ‘biodiversity’ to ‘biological and cultural diversity’ |
| 2 | 38 | C | After 235 | **Propose to add:**  Extent to which of culture, cultural diversity and traditional knowledge are mainstreamed in (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment (data disaggregation) |
| 2 | 38 | B | 236-238 | **Propose to add**Re T19.4, add element: Trends in the inclusion of traditional knowledge (ILK) in global, regional and national knowledge platforms (e.g. IPBES, IPCC, UNESCO) |
| 2 | 38 | C | After 238 | **Proposed indicator in regard to additional element under T19.4 above:** Number of global, regional and national knowledge platforms including traditional knowledge in policies, mechanisms and procedures |
| 2 | 38-40(T20) |  |  | **General point on Target 20**Human rights are indivisible. While critical as a target under Means of Implementation, they need to be linked specifically to substantive rights in Goals and Targets. Participatory rights (as a Means of Implementation) are needed to exercise and realise substantive rights as elaborated by the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), UN Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other People Working in Rural Areas (UNDROP), Convention for the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), Rights of the Child, or as defined in international law. |
| 2 | 38-39 | A | 239-243 | To make the text consistent with the text in the target and in column B, the component T20.1 should be divided into two components as follows: T20.1 Equitable participation of IPLCs in decision-making related to biodiversity T20.1 bis Full recognition and respect of the rights of IPLCs over relevant resources |
| 2 | 38-39 | C | 239-243 | **Propose to add indicators** related to participation of IPLCs, e.g.:* Number of Parties reporting on inclusion of IPLCs in the updating, implementation and monitoring of NBSAPs, and their full and effective participation in the implementation of the post-2020 GBF at all levels.
* Number of Parties with designated Focal Point of Art. 8(j) and related provisions
 |
| 2 | 38-39 | C | 239-243 | **Propose to add indicators** identified by the Indigenous Navigator monitoring tool with respect to rights of Indigenous Peoples in regard to T20.1 and additional component T20.1(bis) : <http://nav.indigenousnavigator.com/images/Documents/Tools/Navigator_UNDRIPIndicators.pdf>Highly relevant to the post2020 goals and targets are indigenous rights pertaining to:Customary Law (T8,T12)Consultation and free, prior informed consent (T2, T12, T16, T17, T18, T19, T20)Languages (T19)Cultural Integrity (T8, T18, T19, T20)Cultural heritage, traditional knowledge and intellectual property (T16, T19) Land, territories and resources (T1, T2, T7, T8, T9, T14, T16)Environment (T1, T2, T3, T4)Participation in Public Life (T20 and other targets affecting IPLCs)The Right to Food (T8, T9) The Right to Development (T12, T13)Education (T19)Health (T8, T12)These are also operational indicators relevant to the targets identified above.  |
| 2 | 38-39 | C | 239-243 | Given that traditional knowledge is a cross cutting theme, indicators relevant for IPLCs are needed under Goals A, B and C, and associated Targets 1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,12, 16 and 18 require data disaggregation for IPLCs and women. Complementary outcome indicators related to these targets can be monitored through community-based monitoring and information systems (CBMIS) applying the indicators identified in the Indigenous Navigator monitoring tool (see above).  |
|  |  | C | 239-243 | The proposed indicators under Target 20 (land use change, land tenure and traditional occupations) which have been adopted through COP decisions, are better placed as components under Goals A, B and C and associated Targets, and operationalised using human rights-based structural, process and outcome indicators to measure progress in implementation. * Trends in land use change and security of land tenure under T1 and T2
* Trends in the practice of traditional occupations in T8 and T9
* Trends in linguistic diversity in T19

Appropriate indicators under Target 20, regarding the recognition of rights of IPLCs, women and youth and their equitable participation in decision-making can be addressed and monitored through community-based monitoring and information systems (CBMIS), as complementary tools to global and national monitoring and reporting. A good example is the Indigenous Navigator which monitors implementation of the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, the SDGs and the Outcome Document of the World Conference on Indigenous PeoplesCommunity participatory research, data generation and analysis, using such tools such as community cultural mapping, the Indigenous Navigator, (nav.indigenousnavigator.com) and Local Biodiversity Outlooks are useful for monitoring community outcomes in regard to global policy goals, for increased transparency and accountability and for ground-truthing satellite information as well as global and national data.  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | Additional rows can be added to this table by selecting “Table” followed by “insert” and “rows below” |

*Comments should be sent by e-mail to* *secretariat@cbd.int****no later than 25 July 2020****.*

1. “Reframing the Wilderness Concept can Bolster Collaborative Conservation”

  [https://www.cell.com/trends/ecology-evolution/fulltext/S0169-5347(20)30167-1](https://www.cell.com/trends/ecology-evolution/fulltext/S0169-5347%2820%2930167-1) [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. <http://www.fao.org/family-farming-decade/home/en/> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. www.hcvnetwork.org [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. Ogar et al., Science Must Embrace Traditional and Indigenous Knowledge to Solve Our Biodiversity Crisis, One Earth (2020), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.oneear.2020.07.006 [↑](#footnote-ref-5)