|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **CBD** | |
|  | | | | Distr.  GENERAL  CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/1/Add.1  17 November 2017  ENGLISH ONLY |

Expert workshop to develop options for modifying the description of ecologically or biologically significant marine areas, for describing new areas, and for strengthening the scientific credibility and transparency of this process

Berlin, 5-8 December 2017

# Annotations to the provisional agenda

# INTRODUCTION

1. The Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity, at its tenth meeting, established a global process, based on the organization of a series of regional workshops (decision X/29, para. 36), for describing ecologically or biologically significant marine areas (EBSAs) through the application of the scientific criteria in annex I to decision IX/20 as well as other relevant compatible and complementary nationally and intergovernmentally agreed scientific criteria.

2. At its tenth meeting, the Conference of the Parties noted that the application of the scientific criteria in annex I to decision IX/20 for the identification of ecologically and biologically significant marine areas (the “EBSA criteria”) presents a tool which Parties and competent intergovernmental organizations may choose to use to progress towards the implementation of ecosystem approaches in relation to areas both within and beyond national jurisdiction, through the identification of areas and features of the marine environment that are important for conservation and sustainable use of marine and coastal biodiversity (decision X/29, para. 25).

3. In paragraph 26 of the same decision, the Conference of the Parties noted that the application of the EBSA criteria is a scientific and technical exercise, that areas found to meet the criteria may require enhanced conservation and management measures, and that this can be achieved through a variety of means, including marine protected areas and impact assessments, and emphasizes that the identification of ecologically or biologically significant marine areas and the selection of conservation and management measures is a matter for States and competent intergovernmental organizations, in accordance with international law, including the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea.

4. Pursuant to requests by the Conference of the Parties, CBD regional workshops to describe areas meeting the EBSA criteria have been held for most of the world’s ocean areas (nearly 74 per cent global ocean coverage, or nearly 82 per cent global ocean coverage without including the area under the Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources). The workshops have addressed areas within national jurisdiction when so decided by the countries concerned. It should be noted that there is an ongoing process, led by the Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic (OSPAR Commission) and the North-East Atlantic Fisheries Commission, for the description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria in the North-East Atlantic.

5. Pursuant to decisions X/29, XI/17 and XII/22, the Conference of the Parties, at its eleventh, twelfth and thirteenth meetings, considered the summary reports on the description of areas that meet the EBSA criteria, prepared by the Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice at its sixteenth meeting (the first two workshops), eighteenth meeting (the next seven workshops), and twentieth meeting (the next three workshops), respectively. Pursuant to decisions XI/17, XII/22 and XIII/12, the summary reports were included in the EBSA repository and submitted to the United Nations General Assembly and its relevant working groups, by means of a letter from the Executive Secretary of the Convention on Biological Diversity addressed to the Secretary‑General of the United Nations,[[1]](#footnote-1) as well as Parties, other Governments and relevant international organizations in line with the purpose and procedures set out in decisions X/29, XI/17 and XII/22.

6. At its eleventh meeting, the Conference of the Parties affirmed that scientific description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and other relevant criteria is an open and evolving process that should be continued to allow ongoing improvement and updating as improved scientific and technical information becomes available in each region (decision XI/17, para. 9).

7. At its thirteenth meeting, the Conference of the Parties welcomed voluntary practical options for further enhancing scientific methodologies and approaches of the scientific and technical exercises, including collaborative arrangements, for the description of areas meeting the criteria for ecologically or biologically significant marine areas, as contained in annex II to decision XIII/12, which can help ensure that the best available scientific and technical information and traditional knowledge of various users of marine resources, including fishers, are used for the EBSA process and that its products are scientifically sound and up-to-date.

8. Pursuant to the request by the Conference of the Parties at its thirteenth meeting (decision XIII/12, para. 10) and with financial support from the Governments of Germany and Sweden, the Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity is convening the Expert Workshop to Develop Options for Modifying the Description of Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine Areas, for Describing New Areas, and for Strengthening the Scientific Credibility and Transparency of this Process, from 5 to 8 December 2017. The workshop will be hosted by the Government of Germany.

9. Pursuant to the same decision, this expert workshop shall have the following objectives:

1. To develop options, for cases both within and beyond national jurisdiction, regarding procedures within the Convention to modify the description[[2]](#footnote-2) of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and to describe new areas, while fully respecting the sovereignty, sovereign rights and jurisdiction of coastal States reaffirmed in paragraph 3 of decision XIII/12; and

(b) To develop options for strengthening the scientific credibility and transparency of the EBSA process, including by enhancing the scientific peer review by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations.

10. A list of documents for the workshop is contained in annex I.

11. The Secretariat has issued an information note for participants containing details of logistical arrangements, including information on travel, visa requirements, accommodation and other matters for the workshop (<https://www.cbd.int/doc/c/28bb/e0b7/4e8c2cfed29594bd3c7fc2f1/ebsaem-2017-01-info-note-en.pdf>). The workshop will be conducted in English.

12. Registration of participants will commence at 8 a.m. on Tuesday, 5 December 2017.

# ITEM 1. OPENING OF THE workshop

13. Representatives of the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation, Building and Nuclear Safety of Germany and the Executive Secretary of the Convention on Biological Diversity will open the workshop at 9 a.m. on Tuesday, 5 December 2017.

ITEM 2. ELECTION OF THE workshop CO-CHAIRS, ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND ORGANIZATION OF WORK

14. After a brief explanation by the Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity on procedures for electing the workshop co‑chairs, the participants will be invited to elect the workshop co-chairs, based on proposals from the floor.

15. Participants will then be invited to consider the provisional agenda (CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/1) and the proposed organization of work, as contained in annex II to the present document, and adopt them following any amendments deemed necessary.

16. The workshop will be organized in plenary and breakout-group sessions. The workshop co‑chairs will nominate facilitators and rapporteurs for the plenary and breakout sessions, based on the expertise and experience of the workshop participants and in consultation with the Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity.

# ITEM 3. Workshop background, scope and expected output

17. The representative of the Secretariat will give an overview of the EBSA process under the Convention on Biological Diversity, and describe the objectives, scope and expected outputs/outcomes of the workshop.

18. Building upon the presentation, workshop participants will be invited to exchange views on the scope of the workshop and its expected outputs/outcomes.

ITEM 4. Review of regional and national experience on, and lessons learned from, the description of areas meeting the scientific criteria for ecologically or biologically significant marine areas

19. Under this item, participants will have before them a note by the Executive Secretary (CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/2) transmitting a compilation of the submissions of information submitted by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations to support the objectives of this workshop, in response to notification 2017‑107,[[3]](#footnote-3) dated 20 October 2017. The documents/references submitted prior to the workshop are being made available for the information of workshop participants on the workshop webpage (<https://www.cbd.int/meetings/EBSAEM-2017-01>).

20. Through individual presentations and plenary discussion, workshop participants will be invited to review and share their insights on regional and national experience in the description of areas meeting the scientific criteria for EBSAs. Participants will discuss on key lessons learned of relevance to the objectives of this workshop.

ITEM 5. Review of relevant global, regional and national experience on, and lessons learned from, the application of area-based management tools for significant and/or sensitive/vulnerable areas as useful examples and insights for the workshop deliberations

21. Under this item, participants will have before them a note by the Executive Secretary (CBD/EBSA/WS/2017/1/INF/1) transmitting a background information on international trends and distinctive approaches of relevance to the process on ecologically or biologically significant marine areas under the Convention, which compiled relevant global, regional and national experience on, and lessons learned from, the application of area-based management tools for significant and/or sensitive/vulnerable areas as useful examples and insights for the workshop deliberation. This background information was compiled by resource persons commissioned by the Secretariat of the Convention, with financial resources from the Government of Sweden.

22. Workshop participants will be invited to review and share, through individual presentations and plenary discussion, their insights on global, regional and national experience of relevance to the process on EBSAs under the Convention, and identify key lessons learned that can inform the workshop deliberations.

ITEM 6. Development of options regarding procedures within the Convention to modify the description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and to describe new areas

24. Based on the presentations and deliberations of the workshop in plenary session, participants will be invited to split into breakout groups (details of groupings to be determined by the workshop plenary) to discuss various issues and explore possible ways to move forward regarding procedures within the Convention related to the modification of the description[[4]](#footnote-4) of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and the description of new areas.

25. The results of the breakout group discussions will be reported to the plenary for consideration. In the plenary session, workshop participants will identify options regarding procedures within the Convention to modify the description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and to describe new areas.

ITEM 7. Development of options for strengthening the scientific credibility and transparency of the EBSA process

## 26. Based on the presentations and deliberations of the workshop in plenary session, participants will be invited to split into breakout groups (details of groupings to be determined by the workshop plenary) to discuss various issues and explore possible ways to strengthen the scientific creditability and transparency of the EBSA process, including ways to enhance the scientific peer review by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations.

## 27. The results of the breakout groups will be reported to the plenary for consideration. In the plenary session, workshop participants will identify options for strengthening the scientific creditability and transparency of the EBSA process, including ways to enhance scientific peer review by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations.

# ITEM 8. OTHER MATTERS

28. Under this item, consideration may be given to any other matters of relevance raised by participants.

# ITEM 9. ADOPTION OF THE REPORT

29. Participants will be invited to consider and adopt the report of the workshop on the basis of a draft report to be prepared and presented by the workshop co-chairs.

# ITEM 10. CLOSURE OF THE workshop

30. The workshop is expected to close at 5 p.m. on Friday, 8 December 2017.

### Annex I

LIST OF DOCUMENTS FOR The EXPERT WORKSHOP TO DEVELOP OPTIONS FOR MODIFYING THE DESCRIPTION OF ECOLOGICALLY OR BIOLOGICALLY SIGNIFICANT MARINE AREAS, FOR DESCRIBING NEW AREAS, AND FOR STRENGTHENING THE SCIENTIFIC CREDIBILITY AND TRANSPARENCY OF THIS PROCESS

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| *Official documents* | *Title* |
| CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/1 | Provisional agenda |
| CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/1/Add.1 | Annotations to the provisional agenda |
| CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/2 | Compilation of the information submitted by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations to support the objectives of this workshop, in response to the Secretariat’s notification 2017‑107 (Ref. No. SCBD/SPS/DC/SBG/JL/JG/86798) |
| *Information documents* | *Title* |
| CBD/EBSA/EM/2017/1/INF/1 | Background information on international trends and distinctive approaches of relevance to the CBD’s process on ecologically or biologically significant marine areas |
| *Other documents* | *Title* |
|  | [Information Note for Participants](https://www.cbd.int/doc/c/28bb/e0b7/4e8c2cfed29594bd3c7fc2f1/ebsaem-2017-01-info-note-en.pdf) |
| Brochure on the scientific criteria for EBSAs | [Azores Scientific Criteria and Guidance for identifying ecologically or biologically significant marine areas and designing representative networks of marine protected areas in open ocean waters and deep sea habitats](https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/cbwsoi-wafr-01/other/cbwsoi-wafr-01-azores-brochure-en.pdf) |
| UNEP/CBD/EWS.MPA/1/2 | [Report of the Expert Workshop on Ecological Criteria and Biogeographic Classification Systems for Marine Areas in Need of Protection, Azores, Portugal, 2‑4 October 2007](https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ewsebm-01/official/ewsebm-01-02-en.pdfhttps:/www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ewsebm-01/official/ewsebm-01-02-en.pdf) |
| UNEP/CBD/EW-BCS&IMA/1/2 | [Report of the Expert Workshop on Scientific and Technical Guidance on the Use of Biogeographic Classification Systems and Identification of Marine Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction in Need of Protection, Ottawa, 29 September–2 October 2009](https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ewbcsima-01/official/ewbcsima-01-02-en.pdf) |
| UNEP/CBD/SBSTTA/16/INF/9 | [Training Manual for the Description of Ecologically and Biologically Significant Areas (EBSAs) in Open‑Ocean Waters and Deep-Sea Habitats (draft)](https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/sbstta/sbstta-16/information/sbstta-16-inf-09-en.pdf) |
| Reports of regional EBSA workshops | Report of the Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs in the Seas of East Asia (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2015/3/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2015-03/official/ebsaws-2015-03-04-en.pdf>     Report of the North-West Indian Ocean and Adjacent Gulf Areas Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2015/2/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/sbstta/sbstta-20/information/sbstta-20-inf-23-en.pdf>     Report of the North-East Indian Ocean Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2015/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2015-01/official/ebsaws-2015-01-04-en.pdf>    Report of the Mediterranean Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine Areas (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2014/3/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2014-03/official/ebsaws-2014-03-04-en.pdf>    Report of the North-West Atlantic Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2014/2/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2014-02/official/ebsaws-2014-02-04-en.pdf>    Report of the Arctic Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/EBSA/WS/2014/1/5)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2014-01/official/ebsaws-2014-01-05-en.pdf>    Report of the South-Eastern Atlantic Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/SEA/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-sea-01/official/ebsa-sea-01-04-en.pdf> (English)    Rapport de L’atelier Régional de L’atlantique Sud-Est Pour Faciliter la Description des Aires Marines D’importance Écologique ou Biologique  (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/SEA/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-sea-01/official/ebsa-sea-01-04-fr.pdf> (FRANÇAIS)  Report of the North Pacific Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/NP/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-np-01/official/ebsa-np-01-04-en.pdf>    Report of the Eastern Tropical and Temperate pacific Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/ETTP/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-ettp-01/official/ebsa-ettp-01-04-en.pdf> (English)  Informe del Taller Regional del Pacifíco Oriental Tropical y Templado para Facilitar la Descripción de Áreas Marinas de Importancia Ecológica o Biológica (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/ETTP/1/4) <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-ettp-01/official/ebsa-ettp-01-04-es.pdf> ([Español](https://www.cbd.int/doc/c/4a8c/ffe2/5b94a25a025792bc889f7b48/ebsaem-2017-01-ebsa-ettp-01-04-es.pdf" \t "_blank))  Report of the Southern Indian Ocean Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/RW/EBSA/SIO/1/4)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsa-sio-01/official/ebsa-sio-01-04-en.pdf>    Report of the Wider Caribbean and Western Mid-Atlantic Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/SBSTTA/16/INF/7)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/rwebsa-wcar-01/official/rwebsa-wcar-01-sbstta-16-inf-07-en.pdf>    Report of the Western South Pacific Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of EBSAs (UNEP/CBD/SBSTTA/16/INF/6)  <https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/rwebsa-wspac-01/official/rwebsa-wspac-01-sbstta-16-inf-06-en.pdf> |
| Brochure on CBD’s work on EBSAs | [Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine Areas (EBSAs)](https://www.cbd.int/doc/meetings/mar/ebsaws-2014-03/other/ebsaws-2014-03-ebsa-brochure-2012-en.pdf) |
| Website | [EBSA website](http://www.cbd.int/ebsa) |
| EBSA Booklet Volume 3: Southern Indian Ocean  EBSA Booklet Volume 2: Wider Caribbean and Western Mid-Atlantic  EBSA Booklet Volume 1: Western South Pacific Region | <https://www.cbd.int/marine/ebsa/booklet-03-sio-en.pdf>  <https://www.cbd.int/marine/ebsa/booklet-02-wcar-en.pdf>  <https://www.cbd.int/marine/ebsa/booklet-01-wsp-en.pdf> |

### Annex II

PROPOSED Organization of Work

**Tuesday, 5 December 2017**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Time** | **Workshop activities** |
| 9 to 10:30 a.m. | **Agenda item 1. Opening of the workshop**  **Agenda item 2. Election of the workshop co-chairs, adoption of the agenda and organization of work**  **Agenda item 3. Workshop background, scope and expected output**  *Plenary session*   * CBD process for describing areas meeting the scientific criteria for ecologically or biologically significant marine areas (EBSAs) * Workshop objectives, scope and expected outputs/outcomes * Plenary discussion |
| 10.30 to 11 a.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 11 a.m. to 12.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 4. Review of regional and national experience on, and lessons learned from, the description of areas meeting the scientific criteria for ecologically or biologically significant marine areas**  *Plenary session*   * Experience and lessons learned from the series of regional workshops on describing areas meeting the scientific criteria for EBSAs * Experience and lessons learned from national exercises on describing areas meeting the scientific criteria for EBSAs or other relevant compatible and complementary nationally and intergovernmentally agreed scientific criteria * EBSA repository and information-sharing mechanism * Approaches for ensuring scientific credibility and transparency, including scientific peer-review, of the existing EBSA process * Plenary discussion |
| 12.30 to 2 p.m. | *Lunch break* |
| 2 to 2.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 4. *(continued)*** |
| 2.30 to 3.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 5. Review of relevant global, regional and national experience on, and lessons learned from, the application of area-based management tools for significant and/or sensitive/vulnerable areas as useful examples and insights for the workshop deliberations**  *Plenary session*   * Experience and lessons learned from relevant global, regional and national processes * Consolidation of useful examples and insights for the workshop deliberations * Plenary discussion |
| 3.30 to 4 p.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 4 to 5 p.m. | **Agenda item 5*. (continued)*** |

**Wednesday, 6 December 2017**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Time** | **Workshop activities** |
| 9 to 10.30 a.m. | **Agenda item 6. Development of options regarding procedures within the Convention to modify the description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and to describe new areas**  *Plenary session*   * Sharing views and suggestions on possible elements to be considered in developing options regarding procedures within the Convention to modify the description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria and to describe new areas   *Breakout group sessions*   * Groups based on the results of plenary discussion   *Plenary session*   * Reporting of the results of breakout group session * Consideration of potential options |
| 10.30 to 11 a.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 11.a.m. to 12.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 6 *(continued)*** |
| 12.30 to 2 p.m. | *Lunch break* |
| 2 to 3.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 6 *(continued)*** |
| 3.30 to 4 p.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 4 to 5 p.m. | **Agenda item 6 *(continued)*** |

**Thursday, 7 December 2017**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Time** | **Workshop activities** |
| 9 to 10.30 a.m. | **Agenda item 7. Development of options for strengthening the scientific credibility and transparency of the EBSA process**  *Plenary session*   * Sharing views and suggestions on possible elements to be considered in developing options for strengthening the scientific credibility and transparency of the EBSA process, including by enhancing the scientific peer review by Parties, other Governments and relevant organizations   *Breakout group sessions*   * Groups based on the results of plenary discussion   *Plenary session*   * Reporting of the results of breakout group session * Consideration of potential options |
| 10.30 to 11 a.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 11 a.m. to 12.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 7 *(continued)*** |
| 12.30 to 2 p.m. | *Lunch break* |
| 2 to 3.30 p.m. | **Agenda item 7 *(continued)*** |
| 3.30 to 4 p.m. | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 4 to 5 p.m. | **Agenda item 8. Other matters** |

**Friday 28, April 2017**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Time** | **Workshop activities** | | |
| 9 to 10.30 a.m. | | **Agenda item 9. Adoption of the report** |
| 10.30 to 11 a.m. | | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 11 a.m. to 12.30 p.m. | | **Agenda item 9 *(continued)*** |
| 12.30 to 2 p.m. | | *Lunch* *break* |
| 2 to 3.30 p.m. | | **Agenda item 9 *(continued)*** |
| 3.30 to 4 p.m. | | *Coffee/tea break* |
| 4 to 4.45 p.m. | | **Agenda item 9 (*continued*)** |
| 4.45 to 5 p.m. | | **Agenda item 10. Closure of the workshop** |

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. See A/67/838, <http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/67/838>, A/69/794, <http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/69/794>, and A/72/491, <http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A%2F72%2F491&Submit=Search&Lang=E> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria constitutes both a textual description and a polygon of the area, as contained in the relevant decisions of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention, including decisions XI/17 (annex) and XII/22 (annex), and presented in the EBSA repository and the map available at [www.cbd.int/ebsa](http://www.cbd.int/ebsa). Modification of an existing EBSA description in this note constitutes a modification affecting the textual description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria, as contained in the relevant decisions, including decisions XI/17 (annex) and XII/22 (annex), and/or the polygon of the area, as presented in the EBSA repository. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Ref. No. SCBD/SPS/DC/SBG/JL/JG/86798. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. The description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria constitutes both a textual description and a polygon of the area, as contained in the relevant decisions of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention, including decisions XI/17 (annex) and XII/22 (annex), and presented in the EBSA repository and the map available at www.cbd.int/ebsa. Modification of an existing EBSA description in this note constitutes a modification affecting the textual description of areas meeting the EBSA criteria, as contained in the relevant decisions, including decisions XI/17 (annex) and XII/22 (annex), and/or the polygon of the area, as presented in the EBSA repository. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)